

Seminar II: Politics of Bibliography, Textual Editing Abstracts

Emily L. Loney

Reproduction, Pregnancy, and the Queer Futures of Bibliography

As many scholars have observed, early modern descriptions of book production are suffused with gendered and sexualized language. Book production, specifically, was often described as being analogous to sexual intercourse, conception, or childbirth in variants of what Margreta de Grazia and Stephen Guy-Bray have termed the “reproductive metaphor” (de Grazia, 2005; Guy-Bray, 2009). Through this, writing became entangled in the ways that people described sexuality, and textual production was often implicated in heteronormative understandings of reproduction. These sexualized and reproductive frameworks have also pervaded the history of book history, textual editing, and bibliography, as models such as stemmatics make legible, when they describe manuscripts with the language of familial descent, and “family trees.” Yet experiences of pregnancy and reproduction are not inherently heteronormative, nor are book history and bibliography necessarily normative forces. Working at the intersection of book history and sexuality studies and taking the Countess of Pembroke’s *Psalmes* as its focus, this paper proposes a queer reading of manuscript variability and a queer approach to book history, arguing that early modern books had the potential to disrupt heteronormative assumptions about reproduction and that critical methodologies can as well.

Margaret Maurer

EEBO-TCP’s Keyers and the Scholarly Labor of Digitization

EEBO-TCP is a database of 70,000+ books that were transcribed character-by-character by humans. EEBO-TCP partnered with third-party vendors, offshoring this labor of transcription and mark-up to keyers in India and the Philippines. Because editors only proofed 3-5% of each transcription, the foundation of EEBO-TCP (and projects and papers derived from EEBO-TCP) is these keyers’ unedited work. Despite the keyers’ centrality to the project, EEBO-TCP and its endorse do not disclose the keyers’ wages, labor conditions, or precarity. By considering whose labor is visible, credited, and essential, I argue that the absence of this information is in itself troubling, and part of a larger trend on TCP’s website that decenters or erases the keyers’ role and location –despite the fact that the keyers’ scholarly labor is the reason that EEBO-TCP is possible. EEBO-TCP demonstrates the necessity of considering labor as an integral part of digital projects that requires a shift from focusing on the outcome of what is being made to the process of who is doing the making.

Allison Machlis Meyer

Both Extirpate and Vagabond Forever: Material Formations of Faith in Early Modern Compilation

This essay builds upon book history work on the contingent possibilities afforded through compilation by reading intertextually two works from a seventeenth-century *Sammelband* held at the Middle Temple Library to ask what happens when questions about religious difference are explored through works that are materially configured as relational, fluid, and personalized entities. The volume contains five texts, including Robert Ashley's 1627 translation of *Almansor*, John Cotta's 1616 *The Trial of Witchcraft*, a 1619 courtier book, English Hebraist Hugh Broughton's 1613 *Seder Olam*—a chronological argument that attempts to harmonize events of the Hebrew Bible with the New Testament—and a 1593 renunciation of Catholicism by the ex-priest Thomas Bell. Though invested in the explanatory value rabbinical texts hold for chronologies that justify reformed Christianity and millenarianism, Broughton's work also differentiates between ancient biblical Jews and obstinate early modern ones who remain genealogically marked by racialized conceptions of religious faith and a political theology that requires a renewed supersession of Judaism to achieve the goals of the Reformation. Bound with Cotta's calcified assertions of Jewish alterity, *Almansor*'s reclamation of the Islamic history of Al-Andalus, and Bell's argument for the reformed church's ancient past, Broughton's *Seder Olam* destabilizes Christian political theology that demands both the existence and annihilation of Jews to make sense of the Reformation's turn to a historical rather than typological relationship with Christianity's immovable Jewish origins.

David Nicol

High Spirits and Humble Earth: Lineation and Social Rank in William Rowley's All's Lost by Lust

The broad tendency to associate verse with high social rank and prose with low can encourage misperceptions that are explored in William Rowley's *All's Lost by Lust* (c.1619-20). In attempting to create a modern-spelling edition of this play, I have concurred with scholars who argue that the compositors of the 1633 quarto incorrectly rendered many prose speeches as verse. However, previous scholars have applied this principle to only a few of the play's characters. I extend it further to include the intriguing character of Dionysia, a noblewoman who dies uttering what I believe to be speeches in prose while facing off against her enemy, a peasant woman, who dies speaking verse. The overlooking of Dionysia's prose is ironic, given that the play frequently draws attention to, and deliberately muddles, the association of eloquent speech with high rank, and one of the play's tragic events is caused by characters misperceiving high and low registers of speech. In this paper, I explain why Dionysia's speeches should be rendered as prose and how they reflect more broadly the play's examination of the relationship between linguistic and social hierarchies.

Kate Ozment**Citation Féminine: Towards a Feminist Citation Practice**

Hélène Cixous posited the need for an écriture féminine in “The Laugh of Medusa” in 1975, and this theory imagined a language that was removed from what she characterized as masculine linguistic structures. My essay takes inspiration from Cixous’s characterization of language as masculine and examines the form of the citation and its relationship to colonial and patriarchal standards for valuing labor and information in academia. I do not pull from an essentialist understanding of the body as Cixous does, but instead use the work of feminist Marxists who seek to legitimize and compensate the labor of women and digital humanities texts like Data Feminism (2020) that demonstrate how data structures can facilitate or prohibit feminist inquiry. With this framework, I argue that the citation is a mechanical form that grows from print-focused norms in the twentieth century, and it is designed to legitimize some forms of labor (the author) while leaving others invisible and uncompensated (the librarian, the cataloguer). In response, I imagine what a feminist citation practice could look like and use the example of archival documents to make visible the many kinds of feminized labor left to the margins of academic citation practices.

Anthony Guy Patricia**The Queer Problematics of *The Norton Shakespeare*'s “Parody of the marriage ceremony” Gloss in 3.3 of *Othello***

I am concerned in this paper with the part of 3.3 of *Othello* in which Othello and Iago swear their allegiance to one another in a way that, as many have noted, echoes the vows a couple entering into the state of holy matrimony swear in the traditional Christian celebration of the marriage rite. The editor(s) of *The Norton Shakespeare* gloss the union of Othello and Iago with the tersely worded statement: “Parody of the marriage ceremony” (2160). Most often, parody is used to expose the “truth” of something or someone through ridicule. Thus, we can take *The Norton Shakespeare* gloss of Othello and Iago’s swearing of vows in 3.3 of *Othello* as parodic to mean something worthy of ridicule. But why is it ridiculous? The gloss seems to register discomfort with the idea of two men – the characters of Othello and Iago – marrying one another like a man and a woman marry one another. In light of what has happened with the legal acceptance of same-sex marriage throughout the world in the last twenty years, I argue here that labelling Othello and Iago’s same-sex marriage a parody is an untenable editorial stance that is completely out of step with contemporary mores as well as ahistorically incompatible with the actual history of “same-sex marriage” as it is explored in works like John Boswell’s *Same-Sex Unions in Premodern Europe* (New York: Vintage Books, 1994).

Aaron T. Pratt**It's Not Snowing on Miami Vice; Or, Book History's Media Literacy Problem**

Book history is a fundamentally historicist enterprise. So, usually, is bibliography. They take textual artifacts from the past as their objects of study and, crucially, make claims about how people from the past created and interacted with them. They tell us things about books, yes, but like other fields of humanistic inquiry they ultimately seek to explain people: what they did and how they perceived the world. Sometimes a study will focus on a particular individual—say, a reader or a publisher—but, most often, when we interpret books, we're interpreting them on behalf of an anonymous broader population. Either way, I contend that our ethical obligations as historians are the same: when we set out to interpret books on behalf people from the past, it is important that we be clear both about who we're interpreting on behalf of and on what historical basis we're interpreting in the ways we do. In my contribution to this seminar, I will describe a recent trend in book history and contend that it prioritizes the professional politics of our discipline over the historical lives it purports to represent: book history has a media literary problem and an ethical one, too.

Gary Taylor
The Salic Law and Documentary Effects

The Salic Law speech in Shakespeare's Henry V has, since 1877, the most often cited evidence that the quarto (published in 1600) is an unreliable text, based on some unauthoritative method of transmission (memorial reconstruction by actors or reporting by spectators taking notes during performance). I argue that the speech follows Holinshed so closely in order to create a documentary effect (also seen in other parts of the play), but that Shakespeare's intentions are not Holinshed's—and that Shakespeare's values are not those of bibliographers. Both the quarto and folio texts depart from the presentation of the speech in Holinshed, and from the documentary ethics of bibliography, in order to produce something designed not to satisfy its audience (on or off stage).

Andrew Clark Wagner
Private Bodies, Public Writing, and the Prosthetic Book in Titus Andronicus

This essay explores the appearance of Ovid's Metamorphoses onstage in Titus Andronicus, and suggests the book provides Lavinia with an opportunity to make public her rape at the hands of Chiron and Demetrius. Providing a mechanism for her to speak, the book functions as a kind of bodily prosthetic, replacing her tongue and repairing, albeit imperfectly, her maimed body. In this way, the act of reading is presented as a way of making visible the legibility of the body. This conjunction of body and text offers a way of reading the play that makes sense of its apparently contradictory impulses, toward both bookishness and bodily horror.

Sarah Wall-Randell**Building new rooms in Arcadia: Mary, Countess of Pembroke as collaborator**

The work of pioneering feminist scholars in the 1990s succeeded in establishing Mary Sidney Herbert, Countess of Pembroke, as an important early modern poet, translator, editor, and dramatist. The 1998 publication of her *Collected Works* in a Clarendon Press edition served as one kind of official mark of Pembroke's entry into the canon, and an Oxford World's Classics paperback edition of her translation of the Psalms, done in collaboration with Philip Sidney, followed in 2009. But while these high-profile editions have brought deserved attention to Pembroke's translations and devotional works, recognition of her achievement as a writer of prose fiction, specifically in her contributions to the text of her 1593 edition of Sidney's *Arcadia*, has been delayed. In this essay I will examine a passage in Pembroke's folio *Arcadia* that bridges the end of the revised part of Book III and the "Old" *Arcadia* Book III, and that appears neither in the 1590 text nor in any of the extant manuscripts. I will analyze the rigidity of editorial received wisdom (not only in the twentieth century but also in the twenty-first) that has inhibited attribution of this section to Pembroke, and make a case that it is her original work.

Valerie Wayne**The Black Boy Bookshops in Sixteenth-Century London**

This essay merges the resources of book history with critical race studies to inquire into the London bookshops that were located at the sign of the Black Boy and the Black Moryan. There may have been three bookshops that operated under those names in 1530, 1550-1566, and 1561-1599, or they may have been the same shop in Paul's churchyard. The use of "boy" in most references may have applied to a Black servant who worked in the shops, at least at one time, but it is difficult to know. There were many seventeenth-and eighteenth-century shops named the Black Boy and Blackamoor whose goods were the product of foreign trade, especially coffee-houses, tobacconists, and taverns, but it is unclear whether the sixteenth-century bookshops had similar affiliations. Whatever images appeared on them, the bookshop signs objectified a Black person's face or body, turning them into curiosities at best, and at worst into figures of bondage or threat that were contained by a commercial enterprise. The signs drew on racialized imagery and language to attract customers without any apparent connection to the books being sold there, those who were selling them, or those who were represented on the signs.

Katherine Schaap Williams**Editing Early Modern Drama and the Politics of Disability Fictions**

"*Stump.*" or "*Crip.*" or "*Dwarfe*": such speech prefixes in early modern plays (here, the unattributed plays *A Larum for London* and *The Fair Maid of the Exchange*, and Francis Beaumont's *The Knight of the Burning Pestle*) mark out characters according their bodily distinctiveness. Beyond the myriad designations of disability as an element of dramatic

characterization—embedded cues or descriptions that gesture to a character’s embodied difference—such speech prefixes flag disability as a foundation for dramatic character, and often reduce the dramatic character to a stereotype in the process. Drawing upon theoretical insights from critical disability studies, I trace how speech prefixes construct disability at the level of dramatic character and I show how disability complicates the editorial choice to regularize speech prefixes in early modern dramatic texts. Furthermore, considering several examples in which the speech prefixes of an apparently nondisabled character change to reflect a disability fiction—and the editorial choices that occlude or foreground this change—I ask whether such examples constitute a disability metafiction that allegorizes the editorial work of translating between print and performance in early modern drama.

Molly G. Yarn

The Citational Ouroboros: Circular Citation in Collation and Textual Notes

The principles of selecting texts for collation and writing textual notes has long been a vexed issue in the editorial field. As Suzanne Gossett has pointed out, this question has both practical and ideological implications so compelling that a modern editor can find herself ‘[forced]... into analysis of her own scholarly character’. 1 A more recent conversation has urged scholars to consider citation practices in the light of representation and exclusion, encouraging the adoption of ‘conscientious engagement’ with the politics of citation. 2 How does this concept translate into textual editing, a field in which attribution, in its assorted senses, plays so pivotal a role? This paper will explore ways in which editorial collation and citation shape both the narrative of Shakespearean editorial history and the practice of editing.